

Enhanced Evaluation Sample

The following pages include two sample submissions from the same student during his 9th grade year. The original submission is immediately followed by the evaluated/graded sample by one of Kolbe's advisors.

The first sample, an English composition assignment, was the student's first submission of the year. The second sample, a Theology paper topic essay, was the student's 26th submission of the year.

Permission was given by both the parent and student for reproduction of his work. The last name has been left out for identity protection.

English Composition
Quarter 2 Week 1
Pg. 32
Joseph B.
11/27/2007

The popular GEICO Cavemen TV commercials have now been made into a TV series, which loses out versus the commercials. The original commercials portrayed cavemen as still existing in modern society yet earnestly trying to adapt while facing persecution and being the butt of jokes by the car insurance company, GEICO. GEICO claims that using their website is “so easy, a *caveman* can do it!”. The show, however, removes the GEICO point entirely and focuses on the cavemen’s trying to keep up in modern society. The commercials had a serious, unpredictable mood and cinematic feel with very good cameras, besides being non-offensive. Yet the series is wildly different on this subject. The cameras are cheap and blurry junk, the partial seriousness is gone, and a main and inappropriate point in the show is the cavemen constantly trying to get and arguing over girlfriends. Funniness was the biggest point in the ads as the cavemen are highly disturbed over being made fun of by GEICO and the public in general, and openly make that known. The show, on the other hand, is not really funny at all. It focuses on the general public far too much. In contrast, the commercials did not have more than a couple people getting involved as trying to help or hinder the cavemen, or show any caveman trying to get a girlfriend. The bottom line is that the show is junk in comparison with the original commercials, which thankfully still occasionally air.

EES SUBMISSION #1 EVALUATION

Comments in Blue

Dear Joseph,

Let me say first thing that I don't want you to be disturbed by the amount of my comments. This is typical for a first submission. I also have a rather dry sense of humor and I hope it doesn't put you off. I never mock students; only try to point out the foibles we all share.

When writing a compare and contrast it's very easy to work with even numbers of paragraphs. There could be one that covers how they're different and one that covers how they're the same or they can be mixed and matched according to your own system.

However, a paragraph is still just three to seven sentences and each sentence must relate to the topic sentence. This is definitely long enough to be two paragraphs.

I often encourage students to tell me in one sentence what their paper is about. Once you've done that, every thing else you write must support that point. You've done a good job of being concise and precise in this assignment, it just needs to be organized differently.

You've got writing talent and a discerning eye. I hope you continue to critique shows and expose the poor quality on technical as well as moral grounds.

God bless.

Mrs. Cuellar

English Composition

Quarter 2 Week 1

Pg. 32

Joseph B.

11/27/2007

The popular GEICO Cavemen (Watch capitalization.)TV (Even commonly accepted abbreviations like this should be written out in academic writing. I would recommend not shortening it ever, but in a less formal essay such as this one, you could use "TV" after writing it out the first time.) commercials have now been made into a TV series, which loses out versus the commercials. (This is worded awkwardly and although I can tell what you mean, it could be phrased better. In fact, to deliver more of a punch, I'd make it a separate sentence instead of tacking it on the end of your opening statement.

EES SUBMISSION #1 EVALUATION

Comments in Blue

Short sentences have more of an impact and this would be a good place to use one.) The original commercials portrayed cavemen as still existing in modern society yet earnestly trying to adapt while facing persecution and being the butt of jokes by the car insurance company, GEICO. (This looks suspiciously like a run-on sentence. It would be better to break it into two sentences. And if it's possible, I'd avoid ending a sentence with the same word you start the next sentence with. Also, please be aware that my comments are NOT written in a proper academic manner many times, because they're only comments. So please don't do as I do and start sentences with "and" or "so" or "because"! ☺)

GEICO claims that using their website is "so easy, a *caveman* can do it!". The show, however, removes the GEICO point entirely and focuses on the cavemen's (Already plural.) trying to keep up in modern society. (I'm not sure if I understand the point here.)

The commercials had a serious, unpredictable mood and cinematic feel with very good (Could you expound on this point? I don't know what it means for a commercial to have "very good cameras" and you do and one of the reasons to write papers is to provide information to the reader.) cameras, besides being (The use of the word "being" creeps into almost all student papers, but should be avoided.) non-offensive. (I like the points you're making, but they're very different. One is an artistic point and the other is moral. I'd separate them so it doesn't appear to the reader that you weight them equally.) Yet the series is wildly different on this subject. (Are the cameras the subject? I think another word would be more descriptive, perhaps "area"?) The cameras are cheap and blurry junk, (Too colloquial for academic writing.) the partial seriousness is gone, and a main and inappropriate point in the show is the cavemen constantly trying to get and arguing over girlfriends. (Here again very different points are {being} combined—this type of use

EES SUBMISSION #1 EVALUATION

Comments in Blue

of “being” is acceptable ☺ and it detracts from the seriousness of the moral issue. Also the phrasing of the last point is awkward.) Funniness (I think you need to check the dictionary on this one.) was the biggest point in the ads as the cavemen are highly disturbed over being made fun of by GEICO and the public in general, and openly make that known. The show, on the other hand, is not really funny at all. It focuses on the general public far too much. (I don’t know what you mean by this.) In contrast, the commercials did not have more than a couple people getting involved as trying to help (Awkward phrasing.) or hinder the cavemen, or show any caveman trying to get a girlfriend. The bottom line is that the show is junk in comparison with the original commercials, which thankfully still occasionally air.

I don’t usually attach much weight to the grade on a first submission since the student doesn’t have a clear idea of what my standards are, and I don’t think I’ve ever given an A. For your first paper, getting any kind of B is quite good.

GRADE: B-

Theology Quarter 4 Week 1

Joseph B.

Celeste Cuellar

5/8-9/2008

Why Was It Necessary for Christ to Suffer, Die, Rise, and Become Human? Could a mere man have saved humanity?

Why was it necessary for Christ to suffer, die, and rise? And why was it necessary for Him to become human? Could a mere man have atoned for humanity's sins? These are all questions that deserve attention, but still have relatively simple answers.

It was not necessary for Jesus to suffer, die, and rise again. But He chose this powerful manner of saving us from sin to actually give us a taste of how much He loves us. As He said, the greatest love a man can give is his life for his friends. Through Christ's dramatic Way, at least some of His people, being saved from the bonds of sin, have learned to love a little like their Maker.

Similarly, it was not necessary for Christ to have become human either. He chose this way to make it easier for humanity to relate to Him. This way, his creation could interact with him in the way they interacted with each other. Jesus was very generous in the ways He chose to come to earth—he came humbly, and became one of us. Through this, we have come to know Him better than if we could not sense Him in our normal, human senses.

Mere men could not save themselves from sin. They needed God—Who came down as a simple, and yet complex, Man—to save them. Besides the fact that man is

weak, he cannot break the bonds of sin without being free from it. Christ was free, God, and the Perfect Man, and therefore was the One to save us all.

As shown, though it was not necessary for Christ to suffer, die, rise again, and become human, it helped us greatly by freeing us from sin. A mere man could not have done this by himself. Christ is the fulfillment of his desire—and the only One who loves him infinitively.

EES SUBMISSION #26 EVALUATION
Comments in BLUE

Theology Quarter 4 Week 1

Joseph B.

Celeste Cuellar

5/8-9/2008

Why Was It Necessary for Christ to Suffer, Die, Rise, and Become Human? Could a mere man have saved humanity?

Why was it necessary for Christ to suffer, die, and rise? And why was it necessary for Him to become human? Could a mere man have atoned for humanity's sins? These are all questions that deserve attention, but still have relatively simple answers. (This sentence is not technically correct. I mean in the mechanical sense, not pertaining to the content. You're contrasting two things that aren't equal. They aren't related in the way you're relating them. This is a time for the non-contrasting conjunction, "and." Or if you want to make a contrast—I just read the sentence again a few times and now I think I see what your intention was—then use "although." There is a contrast, but not enough of one to use "but." *Although they have relatively simple answers, these are all questions that deserve attention.*)

It was not necessary for Jesus to suffer, die, and rise again. But (However) He chose this powerful manner of saving us from sin to actually give (Separating the verb from "to" by inserting a word in between, usually an adverb, creates a split infinitive. Either leave the adverb out, or rewrite the sentence and use it somewhere else. In this case, I think it's best to leave it out, but you could write it this way instead: "However, He chose this powerful manner of saving us from sin to give us an actual..." That's a little awkward though, so I'd recommend just leaving it out.) us a taste of how much He

EES SUBMISSION #26 EVALUATION

Comments in BLUE

loves us. As He said, the greatest love a man can give is his life for his friends. (Since you're paraphrasing a scripture quotation you need to give the citation.) Through Christ's dramatic Way, at least some of His people, being saved from the bonds of sin, have learned to love a little like their Maker. (This is a great sentence! In order to make it more dramatic, use a dash. *Through Christ's dramatic Way, at least some of His people—being saved from the bonds of sin—have learned to love a little like their Maker.*)

Similarly, it was not necessary for Christ to have become human either. He chose this way to make it easier for humanity to relate to Him. This way, his (You may choose to capitalize pronouns for Christ or not, but you must be consistent.) creation could interact with him in the way they interacted with each other. Jesus was very generous in the ways He chose to come to earth—he came humbly, and became one of us. (The dash in this sentence is fine or you could also use a colon since what comes after it explains what was before it.) Through this, we have come to know Him better than if we could not sense (Just for variety, since you use "senses" too, substitute "perceive.") Him in our normal, human senses.

Mere men could not save themselves from sin. They needed God—Who came down as a simple, and yet complex, Man—to save them. Besides the fact that man is weak, he cannot break the bonds of sin without being free from it. Christ was free, God, and the Perfect Man, and therefore was the One to save us all. (Really good paragraph!!)

As shown, though it was not necessary for Christ to suffer, die, rise again, and become human, it helped us greatly by freeing us from sin. A mere man could not have done this by himself. Christ is the fulfillment of his (I was confused when I first read this, I thought the pronoun "his" referred to God. Then I figured out it must refer to man. I

EES SUBMISSION #26 EVALUATION

Comments in BLUE

would use “man” instead of “his” for clarity.) desire—and the only One who loves him
infinitively.

Good job Joseph! This is a well-written paper. The missing scripture citation and the inconsistency with capitalization for pronouns referring to Christ are the only real errors. The other things I pointed out are more style issues.

God bless,
Mrs. Cuellar

GRADE: A-